Government of West Bengal
Finance Department, PPP Cell
Nabanna, 325 Sarat Chatterjee Road
Howrah-711102

No- 3763- F (Y) Dated: 30.10.2025

Subject : RESPONSE to the PRE-BID QUERIES of the RFP for Empanelment of Transaction Advisor by Finance Department, Government of West Bengal for Public Private Partnership (PPP) Projects.

SL.	CLAUSE	QUERIES/ Point of Clarification	RESPONSE FROM FINANCE DEPARTMENT
Spine Advisory Pvt. Ltd.			
1.	Clause 3.1 Essential Qualifications for Transaction Advisors S. No - II	The Applicant shall have received a minimum of Rs. 50 crores (Rs. Fifty crore) or US $ 25 mn (USD Twenty-five million) per annum as professional fees during each of the last 3 (three) financial years. For the avoidance of doubt, professional fees hereunder refer to fees received by the Applicant for providing advisory or consultancy services to its clients. As per the Department of Expenditure, Ministry of Finance's OM No. F.20/2/2014-PPD(Pt.) dated 20.09.2016, it is advised that turnover requirements should be reasonable and not be fixed at a level that could restrict competition or exclude capable MSMEs and mid-sized firms, particularly in consultancy assignments where intellectual capacity and domain expertise are key. We, therefore, request you to revise the turnover eligibility requirement to Rs. 20 crore Average of the preceding three financial years, which would still ensure participation from	The clause will remain the same as per the RFP. No change.

		experienced firms while also encouraging broader competition inline with Central Government's procurement reforms.	
2.	Clause 5 Criteria for Evaluation S. No - B-1	**Average Annual Turnover of the firm from Consulting Services in India for the last 3 financial years ending 31st March 2025 – 15 marks** Turnover (Rs Cr) ▪ More than 50 - 75 - 8 Marks ▪ More than 75 - 100 - 10 Marks ▪ More than 100 - 15 Marks (Turnover from audit, assurance, tax, legal and other regulatory services would not be considered) **Average annual turnover of the firm for last 3 financial years ending on 31st March 2025 – 15 Marks** Turnover (Rs Cr) ▪ More than - 20 - 10 Marks ▪ More than 25 - 15 Marks (Turnover from audit, assurance, tax, legal and other regulatory services would not be considered)	The clause will remain the same as per the RFP. No change.
BDO India Services Private Limited			
1.		Would request for **clarification if the last 3 financial** years can be considered as FY 21-22, FY 22-23 and FY 23-24, as for most organisations the audited financial statements for FY 24-25 are not available	If the FY 2024-25 financial statements are not audited yet, in that case Audited Financial Statements of preceding 3 FYs will be considered.
2.		In terms of "**other mandatory requirements**" for essential qualifications for TA (ref Section 3.1) – we would request the FD to clarify if o The Declaration document for not being blacklisted should be on a notarised stamp paper	The documents are to be furnished on a notarised stamp paper.

		OR can be given on the bidder's letterhead, signed and stamped by the authorised signatory o The other declarations (as per Appendix 7,8,9 in the RFP) need to be furnished on a notarised stamp paper OR on the bidder's letterhead will do.	
3.		Request to clarify if the **processing fees of Rs. 75000 is refundable** or not.	Processing Fees are non-refundable.
4.		**In Section 5 of the RFP under Criteria for Evaluation (A-4) on technical presentation**, 25 marks have been allotted for Firm's capability in such projects, Approach and methodology, Know-how of PPP landscape, experience and team proposed. We would request for clarification for the split of these 25 marks across each of these heads, so that we can prepare the proposal accordingly.	The clause itself is self-explanatory, no need of further explanation. Bidder is requested to make Technical Presentation based on this clause.
5.		Would request for clarification, if the presentation (as stated in the previous point under A-4 in Section 5, Criteria for Evaluation) needs to be submitted along with the proposal OR it may be submitted later during the presentation stage.	The presentation need to be made physically in presence of Technical Evaluation Committee and the same will be submitted for consideration of the committee. Tentative Date of Technical Presentation - 12.11.2025 at 3 PM Room No 1202 Conference Room , Nabanna.
6.		In Section 5 of the RFP under Criteria for Evaluation on Financial competence of the Firm (B-1), we would request for considering the last 3 financial years as FY 21-22, FY 22-23 and FY 23-24 (instead of FY 22-23, FY 23-24 and FY 24-25)	If the FY 2024-25 financial statements are not audited yet, in that case Audited Financial Statements of preceding 3 FYs will be considered.
7.		We would request the Finance Department to consider CA (with UDIN) certificates as proof for project completions as in many cases, payment receipts from clients may not be available especially for projects which have been completed long back. This is a common practice which is adopted and acknowledged by several Government Authorities as proof of completion of projects where payment receipts are not available.	CA (with UDIN) certificates as proof for project completions will also be considered.

Pre Bid Meeting Queries as per meeting held on 14.10.2025			
8	Clause 3.1 - III	Criteria- The Applicant shall have received a minimum of Rs. 50 crore (Rs. Fifty crore) or US $ 25 mn (USD Twenty-five million) per annum as professional fees during each of the last 3 (three) financial years. For the avoidance of doubt, professional fees hereunder refers to fees received by the Applicant for providing advisory or consultancy services to its clients. Document Requirement : Certificate(s) from its Statutory Auditors stating its total revenues from professional fees from Consultancy during each of the 3 (three) last financial years. If applicant does not have a Statutory Auditor, requisite certificate from firm of Chartered Accountant that ordinarily audits the annual accounts of the applicant	The clause will remain same. No change.
9	Note to Clause 5.2	Documents Required: Copy of Completion certificate **or** Engagement letter/Work order along with payment receipt, certified by a practicing Chartered Accountant, to be enclosed.	The clause will remain same. No change.
10	Clause 5.2 – A-4 Technical Presentation	Technical Presentation	Tentative Date of Technical Presentation - 12.11.2025 at 3 PM Room No 1202 Conference Room , Nabanna and the same will be submitted for consideration of the committee.

Sd/-

Special Secretary
Finance Department